



California Open Online Library for Education & Accessibility

COOL4Ed (the California Open Online Library for Education) was created so that faculty can easily find, adopt, utilize, review and/or modify free and open etextbooks for little or no cost. The COOL4Ed accessibility open textbook evaluations can inform faculty, staff, and students how the free and open etextbooks meet 15 accessibility “checkpoints” that could impact the learning of learners with a range of disabilities.

SUMMARY OF ACCESSIBILITY EVALUATION:

Textbook: Current Frontiers in Cell Biology
Format of Textbook: PDF

Assistive Technology (AT) Evaluation Score: Overall	4.4 (Maximum score = 10)
<p>Assistive Technologies (AT) Evaluations applies specialized tools and software in the accessibility evaluation process. These specialized assistive technologies, see list below, are typically not used or available by the general public into the accessibility evaluation process.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accessibility features of desktop operating systems (e.g. high-contrast display themes, settings from the Keyboard and Mouse control panels) • Accessibility-related software included with desktop operating systems (e.g. VoiceOver, Microsoft Narrator) • Third-party accessibility software and hardware: • Screen readers (e.g. JAWS, Window Eyes) • Magnification software (e.g. ZoomText Magnifier/Reader, MAGIC Pro with Speech) • Reading software for users with learning disabilities (e.g. Read and Write Gold, Kurzweil 3000) • Refreshable Braille displays 	
Non- Assistive Technology (NAT) Evaluation Score: Overall	3.4 (Maximum score =10)
<p>Non-Assistive Technologies (NAT) Evaluations applies only native or basic tools and software such as the keyboard and Narrator in the accessibility evaluation process. These non-assistive technologies are readily available and used by the general public.</p>	



COOL4Ed Accessibility Evaluation Methods:

The California State University [Accessible Technology Initiative](#) and [MERLOT](#) (Multimedia Educational Resources for Learning and Online Teaching) developed the rubric or “checkpoints” for the accessibility evaluation. [CAST](#), a nationally recognized organization with expertise in accessibility and UDL, reviewed and affirmed the appropriateness and value of the accessibility evaluation rubric and contributed the references and support resources to help people learn how best to design, evaluate, and remediate the learning materials to maximize the accessibility of the learning resources for all. The “checkpoints” have been built upon the Section 508 technical standards and has been organized and tailored to the typical characteristics of digital resources used in higher education courses.

The accessibility evaluations were performed by the [Center for Usability in Design and Accessibility](#) at California State University, Long Beach; faculty and graduate students with expertise in human factors, usability, and accessibility performed the evaluations of over 150 free and open etextbooks. COOL4ed.org has published the accessibility evaluation rubric and provides a detailed description of the methodology used to evaluate the accessibility of the etextbooks in COOL4ed.

LOOKING FOR DETAILED ACCESSIBILITY REPORTS?

[See Detailed Accessibility Evaluation Report using Assistive Technologies](#)

[See Detailed Accessibility Evaluation Report using Non-Assistive Technologies](#)



DETAILED ACCESSIBILITY EVALUATION REPORT using Assistive Technologies

Assistive Technologies (AT) Evaluations applies specialized tools and software in the accessibility evaluation process. These specialized assistive technologies, such as Kurzweil and NVDA, are typically not used or available by the general public into the accessibility evaluation process.

1. Accessibility Documentation

A. The organization providing the online materials has a formal accessibility policy.	Fail
Additional Information:	Could not find this information.
B. The organization providing the online materials has an accessibility statement.	Fail
Additional Information:	Could not find this information.
C. An Accessibility Evaluation Report is available from an external organization.	Fail
Additional Information:	Could not find this information.

2. Text Access

A. The text of the digital resource is available to assistive technology that allows the user to enable text-to-speech (TTS) functionality.	Pass
Additional Information:	NVDA read all the text on pages 1-3 in Chapter 1 and 1-2 in Chapter 2. However the pace was very fast and it always read the footers on each page which disrupted the flow of reading.

3. Text Adjustment

A. Text is compatible with assistive technology.	Fail
Additional Information:	Used Adobe Reader XI and the text size did not adjust. Text size would get smaller than 100% but text size would not get larger than 100%. Checked pages 1-3 in Chapter 1 and 1-2 in Chapter 2.



<p>B. The resource allows the user to adjust the font size and font/background color (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader) that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Used Adobe Reader XI to adjust the font and colors. Although the font and background color changed there was always a white square in the center of the page that did not change background color. Checked pages 1-3 in Chapter 1 and 1-2 in Chapter 2.</p>

4. Reading Layout

<p>A. Text of the digital resource is compatible with assistive technology that allows the user to reflow the text by specifying the margins and line spacing (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Used Adobe Reader XI and the text did not reflow. Checked pages 1-3 in Chapter 1 and 1-2 in Chapter 2.</p>
<p>B. If the digital resource is an electronic alternative to printed materials, the page numbers correspond to the printed material.</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No printed version.</p>

5. Reading Order

<p>A. The reading order for digital resource content logically corresponds to the visual layout of the page when rendered by assistive technology.</p>	<p>Pass</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Used NVDA and checked the digital resource layout on pages 4, 9, 17 in Chapter 1 and 6, 12 in Chapter 2. The reading order logically correspond to the page.</p>



6. Structural Markup/Navigation

<p>A. The text of the digital resource includes markup (e.g. tags or styles) that allows for navigation by key structural elements (chapters, headings, pages) using assistive technology (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Used NVDA and checked pages 1-2 in Chapter 1 and 1-2 in Chapter 2. No headings were found. "No next heading"</p>
<p>B. The text of the digital resource includes markup for bullets and numbered lists that is compatible with assistive technology (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No lists found.</p>
<p>C. If the text of the digital resource is delivered within an ebook reader application, a method is provided that allows users to bypass the reader interface and move directly to the text content that is compatible with assistive technology.</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Not using reader application.</p>

7. Tables

<p>A. Data tables include markup (e.g. tags or styles) that identifies row and column headers in a manner that is compatible with assistive technology (or are rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Used NVDA to check table markup. Did not detect tables "no next table". Checked tables on pages 11, 12, and 22 of Chapter 1. No other tables found.</p>



8. Hyperlinks

A. In-book links take you to a location within the textbook. For example, the table of contents would be considered in-book links and embedded links take you to the correct location in the book.	N/A
Additional Information:	No in book links found.
B. Live hyperlinks take you to any website or webpages external to the book.	Fail
Additional Information:	Checked live links on pages 29 of Chapter 1 and 27 of Chapter 2. No other links were found in the book.
C. Live links take you to the correct webpage that is functioning properly.	Fail
Additional Information:	0/4 live links were functional.
D. Live links are descriptive enough for the users to know where it should take them.	Fail
Additional Information:	0/4 live links had an acceptable description. All live links used the web URL.

9. Color and Contrast

A. All information within the material that is conveyed using color is also available in a manner that is compatible with those that do not perceive color, and information conveyed by color is also conveyed in other ways.	N/A
Additional Information:	There was no use of color to indicate things such as links so there was no need for color redundancy.
B. Information is conveyed from the sub-categories for contrast.	Pass
Additional Information:	Checked pages 1-2 in Chapter 1 and page 1 in Chapter 2.
C. Contrast for headers passed WCAG AA standards for large texts (contrast ratio 3:1).	Pass
Additional Information:	All headers passed color contrast requirements.



D. Contrast for text passed WCAG AA standards for normal texts (contrast ratio of 4.5:1).	Pass
Additional Information:	All text passed color contrast requirements.
E. Contrast for simple images (for example, images of atoms) passed WCAG AA standards (contrast ratio of 4.5:1).	N/A
Additional Information:	No simple images found.

10. Language

A. The text of the digital resource includes markup that declares the language of the content in a manner that is compatible with assistive technology.	N/A
Additional Information:	Cannot check this because do not have Adobe Acrobat Pro.
B. If the digital resource includes passages in a foreign language, these passages include markup that declares the language in a manner that is compatible with assistive technology.	N/A
Additional Information:	Cannot check this because do not have Adobe Acrobat Pro.

11. Images

A. Non-decorative images have alternative text that is compatible with assistive technology (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).	Fail
Additional Information:	NVDA did not detect non-decorative images, there was no alternative text and the descriptions were not descriptive enough. Checked pages 1-3 in Chapter 1 and 6-9 in Chapter 2.



B. Decorative images are marked with null alternate text or contain markup that allows them to be ignored by assistive technology.	N/A
Additional Information:	No decorative images found.
C. Complex images, charts, and graphs have longer text descriptions that are compatible with assistive technology (or are rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader) that offers this functionality).	Fail
Additional Information:	NVDA did not detect complex images, there was no alternative text and the descriptions were not descriptive enough. Checked pages 1-3 in Chapter 1 and 6-9 in Chapter 2.

12. Multimedia

A. A synchronized text track (e.g. open or closed captions) is provided with all video content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No multimedia found.
B. A transcript is provided with all audio content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No multimedia found.
C. Audio/video content is delivered via a media player that is compatible with assistive technology. This includes support for all criteria listed in Section 15 below.	N/A
Additional Information:	No multimedia found.

13. Flickering

A. The digital resource content does not contain anything that flashes more than three times in any one-second period.	Pass
Additional Information:	No flickering found.



14. Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM)

A. STEM figures have appropriate markup that indicates that the image is a figure.	Pass
Additional Information:	10/10 figures had labels. Checked figures on pages 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 in Chapter 1 and 6, 7, 8, 12, 14 in Chapter 2.
B. STEM graphs have appropriate markup that indicates that the image is a graph.	N/A
Additional Information:	No graphs found.
C. STEM equations have appropriate markup that indicates that the image is an equation.	N/A
Additional Information:	No equations found.
D. STEM tables have appropriate markup that indicates the image is a table.	Pass
Additional Information:	3/3 tables had labels. Checked tables on pages 11, 12, 22 of Chapter 1. No other tables found.
E. STEM figures have appropriate notation markup that conveys both the notation (presentation) and meaning (semantics) of the STEM content.	Fail
Additional Information:	0/10 figures had acceptable descriptions and the readers skip over the images. Checked figures on pages 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 in Chapter 1 and 6, 7, 8, 12, 14 in Chapter 2.
F. STEM graphs have appropriate notation markup that conveys both the notation (presentation) and meaning (semantics) of the STEM content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No graphs found.
G. STEM equations have appropriate notation markup that conveys both the notation (presentation) and meaning (semantics) of the STEM content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No equations found.



H. Assistive technology used can access the content from the STEM tables.	Fail
Additional Information:	0/3 tables had good descriptions and the reader read it in a confusing way (did not indicate rows and columns). Checked tables on pages 11, 12, 22 of Chapter 1. No other tables found.

15. Interactive Elements

A. Each interactive element (e.g. menu, hyperlink, button) and function (e.g. annotations) allows keyboard-only operation both with and without assistive technology.	N/A
Additional Information:	No interactive elements found.
B. Each interactive element conveys information to assistive technology regarding the element's name, type, and status (e.g. "Play, button, selected").	N/A
Additional Information:	No interactive elements found.
C. All instructions, prompts, and error messages necessary to complete forms are conveyed as text to assistive technology (or are rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).	N/A
Additional Information:	No interactive elements found.



DETAILED ACCESSIBILITY EVALUATION REPORT using Non-Assistive Technologies

Non-Assistive Technologies (NAT) Evaluations applies only native or basic tools and software such as the keyboard and Narrator in the accessibility evaluation process. These non-assistive technologies are readily available and used by the general public.

1. Accessibility Documentation

A. The organization providing the online materials has a formal accessibility policy.	Fail
Additional Information:	No Content Found
B. The organization providing the online materials has an accessibility statement.	Fail
Additional Information:	No Content Found
C. An Accessibility Evaluation Report is available from an external organization.	Fail
Additional Information:	No Content Found

2. Text Access

A. The text of the digital resource is available to assistive technology that allows the user to enable text-to-speech (TTS) functionality.	Fail
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-5 of Chapter 1 were checked. The text is not available to assistive technology. The reader said "Warning, Empty page."

3. Text Adjustment

A. Text is compatible with assistive technology.	Fail
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-5 of chapter 1 were checked. When the window page changed in size, a horizontal bar appeared. The font size of all pages checked could not be adjusted.
B. The resource allows the user to adjust the font size and font/background color (or is	Fail



rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader) that offers this functionality).	
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-5 of Chapter 1 were checked. When changing the font/background color to green text on black, the background color changed to black, and the font color changed to green. However, on all the pages the middle of each page was white and did not change to black.

4. Reading Layout

A. Text of the digital resource is compatible with assistive technology that allows the user to reflow the text by specifying the margins and line spacing (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).	Fail
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-5 of Chapter 1 were checked. I was not able to reflow the text. The text to speech function said "warning empty page." This was consistent on all pages checked.
B. If the digital resource is an electronic alternative to printed materials, the page numbers correspond to the printed material.	N/A
Additional Information:	Need additional information. We do not have printed material to compare it too.

5. Reading Order

A. The reading order for digital resource content logically corresponds to the visual layout of the page when rendered by assistive technology.	Fail
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-5 of Chapter 1 were checked. The reading order could not be checked. The reader said "warning empty page" because the text was not available for assistive technology.



6. Structural Markup/Navigation

<p>A. The text of the digital resource includes markup (e.g. tags or styles) that allows for navigation by key structural elements (chapters, headings, pages) using assistive technology (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No method provided that allows user to bypass sections of text. The Title and Bookmarks tagged PDF and Headings failed using the accessibility checker.</p>
<p>B. The text of the digital resource includes markup for bullets and numbered lists that is compatible with assistive technology (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No markups found. The Title and Bookmarks tagged PDF and Headings failed using the accessibility checker.</p>
<p>C. If the text of the digital resource is delivered within an ebook reader application, a method is provided that allows users to bypass the reader interface and move directly to the text content that is compatible with assistive technology.</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No additional eReader used.</p>

7. Tables

<p>A. Data tables include markup (e.g. tags or styles) that identifies row and column headers in a manner that is compatible with assistive technology (or are rendered by an application</p>	<p>Fail</p>
---	--------------------



such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).	
Additional Information:	Tables on pages 11 (chap. 1), 12 (chap. 1), 22 (Chap.1), 3 (chap. 5), and 12 (chap. 5) were checked manually. The text was not available to the assistive technology. The reader said "Warning, Empty Page."

8. *Hyperlinks*

A. In-book links take you to a location within the textbook. For example, the table of contents would be considered in-book links and embedded links take you to the correct location in the book.	N/A
Additional Information:	No Withint book links found.
B. Live hyperlinks take you to any website or webpages external to the book.	Fail
Additional Information:	20/20 live links worked. Pgs 1- 20 of Chapter 1 were checked. However non had descriptions.
C. Live links take you to the correct webpage that is functioning properly.	Pass
Additional Information:	20/20 live links worked. Pgs 1-20 of Chapter 1 were checked.
D. Live links are descriptive enough for the users to know where it should take them.	Fail
Additional Information:	0/20 live links had a description. Pgs 1-20 of Chapter 1 were checked. 0 out of the 20 links were in html (URL) form and did not have a description on where the link would take you.

9. *Color and Contrast*

A. All information within the material that is conveyed using color is also available in a manner that is compatible with those that do	Pass
---	-------------



not perceive color, and information conveyed by color is also conveyed in other ways.	
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-29 of Chapter 1 were checked. Information not conveyed by color alone. Size of font, and type of font (Bold versus Non-Bold font) were used. The chapter headings were in black font, bold font, and the size was larger than the rest of the text.
B. Information is conveyed from the sub-categories for contrast.	Pass
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-29 of chapter 1 were checked. Most pages had the contrast ratio of 4.51:1 and above (18.56:1). Chapter headings passed with a ratio of 17.91:1.
C. Contrast for headers passed WCAG AA standards for large texts (contrast ratio 3:1).	Pass
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-29 of chapter 1 were checked. Chapter headings passed with a ratio of 17.91:1.
D. Contrast for text passed WCAG AA standards for normal texts (contrast ratio of 4.5:1).	Pass
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-29 of chapter 1 were checked. Most of the text was above the ratio 4.51:1 (18.56:1).
E. Contrast for simple images (for example, images of atoms) passed WCAG AA standards (contrast ratio of 4.5:1).	Pass
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-29 of chapter 1 were checked. Simple images passed with a ratio of 4.51:1 and above (Example on Page 1- ratio of 20.03:1).

10.Language

A. The text of the digital resource includes markup that declares the language of the content in a manner that is compatible with assistive technology.	Fail
Additional Information:	Using the accessibility checker the primary language failed.



<p>B. If the digital resource includes passages in a foreign language, these passages include markup that declares the language in a manner that is compatible with assistive technology.</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>Using the accessibility checker the primary language failed.</p>

11.Images

<p>A. Non-decorative images have alternative text that is compatible with assistive technology (or is rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>0/10 images included descriptions that were compatible with assistive technology. Pgs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, and 15 of chapter 1 all had images and were checked manually. Overall images did nclude descriptions that were compatible with assistive technology--> Using the accessibility checker, figures alternate text failed.</p>
<p>B. Decorative images are marked with null alternate text or contain markup that allows them to be ignored by assistive technology.</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No Decorative images present.</p>
<p>C. Complex images, charts, and graphs have longer text descriptions that are compatible with assistive technology (or are rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader) that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>Fail</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>10/10 image descriptions did convey meaning (descriptions were not present on most of the images). Pgs 11 (chap. 1), 12 (chap, 1), 22 (Chap.1), 3 (chap. 5), 12 (chap. 5), 9 (chap 8), 11 (chap 8), 13 (chap 8), 6 (Chap 6), and page 10 (chap 9) had images and were checked. All images did contain</p>



	descriptions. However, non of the descriptions were compatible with assistive technology--> Using the accessibility checker, figures alternate text failed.
--	---

12. Multimedia

A. A synchronized text track (e.g. open or closed captions) is provided with all video content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No content found
B. A transcript is provided with all audio content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No content found
C. Audio/video content is delivered via a media player that is compatible with assistive technology. This includes support for all criteria listed in Section 15 below.	N/A
Additional Information:	No content found

13. Flickering

A. The digital resource content does not contain anything that flashes more than three times in any one-second period.	Pass
Additional Information:	Pgs 1-10 were checked. No flickering content was observed. Using the accessibility checker, screen flicker passed.

14. Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM)

A. STEM figures have appropriate markup that indicates that the image is a figure.	Pass
Additional Information:	10/10 figure markups did convey meaning. Pgs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, and 15 of chapter 1 all had images and were checked. Overall the (labels/tags) did convey meaning.
B. STEM graphs have appropriate markup that indicates that the image is a graph.	N/A



Additional Information:	Graphs were marked as figures.
C. STEM equations have appropriate markup that indicates that the image is an equation.	N/A
Additional Information:	No Equations Found.
D. STEM tables have appropriate markup that indicates the image is a table.	Pass
Additional Information:	10/10 table markups did provide enough information to convey meaning. Pgs 11 (chap. 1), 12 (chap, 1), 22 (Chap.1), 3 (chap. 5), 12 (chap. 5), 9 (chap 8), 11 (chap 8), 13 (chap 8), 6 (Chap 6), and page 10 (chap 9) all had tables and were checked. Overall markups did convey meaning.
E. STEM figures have appropriate notation markup that conveys both the notation (presentation) and meaning (semantics) of the STEM content.	Pass
Additional Information:	10/10 notation markups were sufficient to convey meaning. There were descriptions of the figures. Pgs 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, and 15 of chapter 1 all had figures and were checked. The notation markups were sufficient enough to convey presentation.
F. STEM graphs have appropriate notation markup that conveys both the notation (presentation) and meaning (semantics) of the STEM content.	N/A
Additional Information:	Graphs were marked as figures.
G. STEM equations have appropriate notation markup that conveys both the notation (presentation) and meaning (semantics) of the STEM content.	N/A
Additional Information:	No Equations found.
H. Assistive technology used can access the content from the STEM tables.	Pass
Additional Information:	10/10 notation markups provided good descriptions sufficient enough to convey meaning. Pgs 11 (chap. 1), 12 (chap, 1), 22 (Chap.1), 3 (chap. 5), 12 (chap. 5),



	<p>9 (chap 8), 11 (chap 8), 13 (chap 8), 6 (Chap 6), and page 10 (chap 9) all had tables and were checked. This was not sufficient enough to convey presentation.</p>
--	---

15. Interactive Elements

<p>A. Each interactive element (e.g. menu, hyperlink, button) and function (e.g. annotations) allows keyboard-only operation both with and without assistive technology.</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No Interactive Elements Present.</p>
<p>B. Each interactive element conveys information to assistive technology regarding the element's name, type, and status (e.g. "Play, button, selected").</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No Interactive Elements Present.</p>
<p>C. All instructions, prompts, and error messages necessary to complete forms are conveyed as text to assistive technology (or are rendered by an application such as a browser, media player, or reader that offers this functionality).</p>	<p>N/A</p>
<p>Additional Information:</p>	<p>No Interactive Elements Present.</p>

© 2016 California State University (Version 1.0)



This work licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License:
<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>. Please attribute the California State University when using this work.